Evidence Table H-6: Local Wound Applications (Dressings, Topical Applications, and Biological Therapies) Quality Rating\*

Evidence Table H-6a. Local wound applications trial quality rating

| **Author Year Country** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of: a) attrition  b) crossovers  c) adherence  d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Agren, 198593 Sweden | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Alm, 198943 Sweden | No | Unclear | Yes | No | Yes | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Alvarez, 200094  US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Bale, 199744  UK | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Smith and Nephew |
| Bale, 1998(b)45  UK | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Bale, 1998(a)46 UK | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Smith and Nephew |
| Banks, 1994(a)50 UK | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | Calgon Vestal |
| Banks, 1994(b)48 UK | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |

| Evidence Table H-6a. Local wound applications trial quality rating | | | | | | | | | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Author Year Country** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of: a) attrition  b) crossovers  c) adherence  d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| Belmin, 200249  France | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Laboratoires Urgo |
| Bito,  201250  Japan | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | 1. No 2. No 3. No 4. No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Good | Division of Health for the Elderly at Japanese Ministry of Health |

| Evidence Table H-6a: Local Wound Applications Trial Quality Rating, continued |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Author Year Country** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of: a) attrition  b) crossovers  c) adherence  d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| Brod, 199051 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Unclear d) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | Acme/Chaston Division, National Patent Development Corp |
| Brown-Etris, 200852  US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | 3M |
| Burgos, 2000(a)95  Spain | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Laboratories Knoll |
| Burgos, 2000(b)96  Spain | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Knoll, SA |
| Chang, 199853  Malaysia | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | Bristol-Myers Squibb |
| Chuangsuwanich, 201154  Thailand | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Colin, 199655  Multinational | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Colwell, 199356 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | Bristol Myers Squib |
| Darkovich, 199057 US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | No | a) No b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Day, 199558 US, UK and Canada | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear (NA?) | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Felzani, 201197  Italy | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Gerding, 199298  US | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes (Blinded) | a) Unclear  b) Unclear  c) Unclear  d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Gorse, 198759  US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Graumlich, 200399 US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Retirement research foundation |
| Guthrie, 1989100  US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes (reported) | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NET/Ben Franklin Technology Center |
| Hirshberg, 2001122  US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | US Dept of Veterans Affairs |
| Hollisaz, 2004101  Iran | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Iran government agency |
| Honde, 199460  Japan | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Synthelabo Recherche |
| Hsu, 2000102  Japan | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Kaya, 200561  Turkey | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Unclear | No | Poor | NR |
| Kerihuel, 201062  France | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Systagenix |
| Kim, 199663  Korea | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) Yes c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Kloth, 200264  US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Augustine Medical Inc |
| Kraft, 199365  US | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | No | Poor | Calgon Vestal |
| Kuflik, 2001103  US | Unclear | Unclear | No | No | Unclear | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | TopixPharmaceuticals |
| Kurzuk-Howard, 198566  US | No | No | No | No | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | No | Unclear | No | Poor | Acme United |
| Landi, 2003123  Italy | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) NA b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Italian National Research Council |
| LeVasseur, 1991104  Australia | No | No | No | No | Yes | a) Yes  b) Unclear  c) Unclear  d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Matzen, 199967  Denmark | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Meaume, 200369 France | Yes | Yes |  | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Meaume, 200568 France | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Motta, 199970  US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | AcryMed |
| Mulder, 199371  US | Yes | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Muller, 2001105  Germany and The Netherland | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | Knoll AG |
| Mustoe, 1994124  US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a)Yes b) No c) Yes d) No | No | No | Yes | Poor | Amgen |
| Neill, 198972  US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | 3M Company, Medical-Surgical Division |
| Nisi, 2005106  Italy | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Oleske, 198673  US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | No | Poor | Chicago Community Trust |
| Payne, 2001125 US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | Grant O01-AR42967 from NIAMS, National Institutes of Health *Schering-Plough Reasearch Institute and Scois, Inc., provided cytokines used in this study* |
| Payne, 2004126 US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | a)Yes b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Smith & Nephew, Inc. |
| Payne, 200974 US | Yes | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Price, 200075 UK | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Pullen, 2002107  Germany | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yes  b) Unclear  c) Unclear  d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Rees, 1999127  US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Johnson & Johnson |
| Rhodes, 2001108 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear (NA?) | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1992(a)128 Robson, 1992(b)129 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1992(c)132 US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | YEs | a) No b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1994130  US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Immunex |
| Robson, 2000131 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) No b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Sayag, 1996109 France | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Scevola, 2010133  Italy | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | No | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Sebern, 198676 Sebern, 198977 US | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Seeley, 199978 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Shamimi Nouri, 2008a110 Iran | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes b) No c) No d) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | ParsRoos C. |
| Sipponen, 2008111 Finland | No | No | No | No | No | a) No b) No c) No d) No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Small, 200279 South Africa | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Subbanna, 2007112 India | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Good | NR |
| Thomas, 199780  UK | NA | NA | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Thomas, 199881  US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yes  b) Unclear  c) Unclear  d) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Seebum Laboratories |
| Thomas, 200582  US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Tytgat, 1988113  Belgium | No | No | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Whitney, 200183 US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yes b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Augustine Medical Inc |
| Winter, 199084 UK | No | No | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yes b) Yes c) Yes d) No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Coloplast LTD |
| Xakellis,199288 US | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Family Health Foundation of America and ConvaTec |
| Yapucu Gunes, 200786 Turkey | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Yastrub, 200487 US | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | No | Unclear | a) No b) No c) Yes d) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Zeron, 2007114 Mexico | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Unclear b) Unclear c) Unclear d) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |

\*Note: Non-comparative studies used for evaluation of harms only were quality rated but not presented in the evidence tables due to the paucity of reportable data in these studies. Our tables include only studies of comparative effectiveness.