Evidence Table H-6: Local Wound Applications (Dressings, Topical Applications, and Biological Therapies) Quality Rating\*

Evidence Table H-6a. Local wound applications trial quality rating

| **Author YearCountry** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of:a) attrition b) crossovers c) adherence d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Agren, 198593Sweden | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Alm, 198943Sweden | No | Unclear | Yes | No | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Alvarez, 200094US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Bale, 199744UK | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Smith and Nephew |
| Bale, 1998(b)45UK  | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Bale, 1998(a)46UK | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Smith and Nephew |
| Banks, 1994(a)50UK | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | Calgon Vestal |
| Banks, 1994(b)48UK | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |

| Evidence Table H-6a. Local wound applications trial quality rating |
| --- |
| **Author YearCountry** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of:a) attrition b) crossovers c) adherence d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| Belmin, 200249France | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Laboratoires Urgo |
| Bito, 201250Japan | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | 1. No
2. No
3. No
4. No
 | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Good | Division of Health for the Elderly at Japanese Ministry of Health |

| Evidence Table H-6a: Local Wound Applications Trial Quality Rating, continued |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Author YearCountry** | **Appropriate Randomization Technique** | **Allocation concealment adequate?** | **Groups (intervention and control) similar at baseline?** | **Eligibility criteria specified?** | **Outcome assessors masked?** | **Reporting of:a) attrition b) crossovers c) adherence d) contamination** | **Dropout rate <20 percent** | **Intention-to-treat analysis** | **Appropriate Statistical Analyses** | **Risk of Bias (Quality Rating)** | **Funding Source** |
| Brod, 199051US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Uncleard) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | Acme/Chaston Division, National Patent Development Corp |
| Brown-Etris, 200852US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | 3M |
| Burgos, 2000(a)95Spain | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Laboratories Knoll |
| Burgos, 2000(b)96Spain | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Knoll, SA |
| Chang, 199853Malaysia | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | Bristol-Myers Squibb |
| Chuangsuwanich, 201154Thailand | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Colin, 199655Multinational | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Colwell, 199356US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | Bristol Myers Squib |
| Darkovich, 199057US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | No | a) Nob) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Day, 199558US, UK and Canada | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear (NA?) | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Felzani, 201197Italy | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Gerding, 199298US | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes (Blinded) | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Gorse, 198759US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Graumlich, 200399US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Retirement research foundation |
| Guthrie, 1989100US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes (reported) | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NET/Ben Franklin Technology Center  |
| Hirshberg, 2001122US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | US Dept of Veterans Affairs |
| Hollisaz, 2004101Iran | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Iran government agency |
| Honde, 199460Japan | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Synthelabo Recherche |
| Hsu, 2000102Japan | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Kaya, 200561Turkey | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Unclear | No | Poor | NR |
| Kerihuel, 201062France | Yes | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Systagenix |
| Kim, 199663Korea | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Yesc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor  | NR |
| Kloth, 200264US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Augustine Medical Inc |
| Kraft, 199365US | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | No | Poor | Calgon Vestal |
| Kuflik, 2001103US | Unclear | Unclear | No | No | Unclear | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | TopixPharmaceuticals |
| Kurzuk-Howard, 198566US | No | No | No | No | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | No | Unclear | No | Poor | Acme United |
| Landi, 2003123Italy | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) NAb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Italian National Research Council |
| LeVasseur, 1991104Australia | No | No | No | No | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Matzen, 199967Denmark | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Meaume, 200369France | Yes | Yes |  | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Meaume, 200568France | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Motta, 199970US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | Poor | AcryMed |
| Mulder, 199371US | Yes | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Muller, 2001105Germany and The Netherland | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | Knoll AG |
| Mustoe, 1994124US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a)Yesb) Noc) Yesd) No | No | No | Yes | Poor | Amgen |
| Neill, 198972US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | 3M Company, Medical-Surgical Division |
| Nisi, 2005106Italy | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Oleske, 198673US | Unclear | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | No | Poor | Chicago Community Trust |
| Payne, 2001125US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | Grant O01-AR42967 from NIAMS, National Institutes of Health*Schering-Plough Reasearch Institute and Scois, Inc., provided cytokines used in this study* |
| Payne, 2004126US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | No | a)Yesb) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | Smith & Nephew, Inc. |
| Payne, 200974US | Yes | Unclear | No | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Price, 200075UK | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Pullen, 2002107Germany | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Rees, 1999127US | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Johnson & Johnson |
| Rhodes, 2001108US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear (NA?) | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1992(a)128Robson, 1992(b)129US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1992(c)132US | No | No | Unclear | Yes | YEs | a) Nob) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Robson, 1994130US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Immunex |
| Robson, 2000131US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Nob) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Sayag, 1996109France | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Scevola, 2010133Italy | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | No | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Sebern, 198676Sebern, 198977US | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Seeley, 199978US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Shamimi Nouri, 2008a110Iran | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Noc) Nod) No | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | ParsRoos C. |
| Sipponen, 2008111Finland | No | No | No | No | No | a) Nob) Noc) Nod) No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Small, 200279South Africa | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | NR |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Subbanna, 2007112India | Yes | No | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Good | NR |
| Thomas, 199780UK | NA | NA | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Poor | NR |
| Thomas, 199881US | No | No | Yes | Yes | Unclear | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Seebum Laboratories |
| Thomas, 200582US | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | NA | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Good | NR |
| Tytgat, 1988113Belgium | No | No | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Whitney, 200183US | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Yesb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | No | Yes | Yes | Fair | Augustine Medical Inc |
| Winter, 199084UK | No | No | Yes | Yes | Not Reported | a) Yesb) Yesc) Yesd) No | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Poor | Coloplast LTD |
| Xakellis,199288US | No | Unclear | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Fair | Family Health Foundation of America and ConvaTec |
| Yapucu Gunes, 200786Turkey | No | No | Yes | Yes | No | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Unclear | Yes | Fair | NR |
| Yastrub, 200487US | Unclear | Unclear | Unclear | No | Unclear | a) Nob) Noc) Yesd) No | Yes | No | Yes | Poor | NR |
| Zeron, 2007114Mexico | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | Yes | a) Unclearb) Unclearc) Uncleard) Unclear | Yes | Yes | Yes | Poor | NR |

\*Note: Non-comparative studies used for evaluation of harms only were quality rated but not presented in the evidence tables due to the paucity of reportable data in these studies. Our tables include only studies of comparative effectiveness.