

Appendix 7.4 Acupuncture (with or without physical therapy)

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹

Outcome: Pain (pain at moment) measured using VAS 0–10 cm

<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture	Baseline	25	6.5	2.1
Interferential electrotherapy		24	6.5	2
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture	4 weeks	24	3.5	1.9
Interferential electrotherapy		23	3.4	1.9
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 2 months	24	3.1	2.2
Interferential electrotherapy		23	2.4	1.7
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 4 months	24	2.4	2.2
Interferential electrotherapy		23	2	1.5
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 7 months	24	1.7	2.3
Interferential electrotherapy		23	1.3	1.4

a All interventions received concomitant home exercise.

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹

Outcome: Function and disability – Constant Murley Assessment Score

<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture	Baseline	25	65.5	16.7
Interferential electrotherapy		24	59.6	15.4
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture	4 weeks	24	86	8.2
Interferential electrotherapy		23	84.9	8.4
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 2 months	24	89.3	4.8
Interferential electrotherapy		23	92.1	5.9
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 4 months	24	93.3	6.0
Interferential electrotherapy		23	90.2	9.7
Electroacupuncture	Approx. 7 months	24	93.8	6.4
Interferential electrotherapy		23	95.5	4.1

a All interventions received concomitant home exercise.

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹

Outcome: Range of movement

Not reported

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹**Outcome: Quality of life**

Not reported

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹**Outcome: Other**

Not reported

Study: Cheing 2008⁸¹**Outcome: Adverse events**

Not reported

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Pain (pain overall) measured using VAS (range and units of measurement unspecified)**

<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Baseline	77 ^b	7.03	1.33
Electroacupuncture ^c		97 ^c	5.51	2.54
TENS ^b		88 ^b	7.26	1.15
TENS ^c		98 ^c	6.01	2.59
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77 ^b	1.65	2.12
Electroacupuncture ^c		97 ^c	2.31	2.11
TENS ^b		88 ^b	2.28	2.4
TENS ^c		98 ^c	2.65	2.06

a All interventions received concomitant home exercise.

b Patients had 'pre-adhesive capsulitis', which was defined as the patient having increased pain at night, but normal or slightly affected range of movement.

c Patients had adhesive capsulitis, which was defined as some reduction in pain but considerably reduced range of movement that can even affect activities of normal living.

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Function and disability**

Not reported

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Range of movement**

Not reported

Unspecified active range of movement was reported.

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Quality of life**

Not reported

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Other – efficacy rate**

<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean^b</i>	<i>SD</i>
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Cured (mean %)</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77	32	41.6
Electroacupuncture ^c		97	11	11.3
TENS ^b		88	29	33
TENS ^c		98	9	9.2
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Large improvement (mean %)</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77	27	35
Electroacupuncture ^c		97	49	50.5
TENS ^b		88	33	37.5
TENS ^c		98	40	40.8
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Improvement (mean %)</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77	13	16.9
Electroacupuncture ^c		97	35	36.1
TENS ^b		88	23	26.1
TENS ^c		98	46	46.9
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>No improvement (mean %)</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77	5	6.5
Electroacupuncture ^c		97	2	2.1
TENS ^b		88	3	3.4
TENS ^c		98	3	3.1
<i>Intervention^a</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Total efficacy rate (%)</i>	<i>SD</i>
Electroacupuncture ^b	Post treatment	77	93.5	NR
Electroacupuncture ^c		97	97.9	NR
TENS ^b		88	96.6	NR
TENS ^c		98	96.9	NR

NR, not reported.

a All interventions received concomitant home exercise.

b Patients had 'pre-adhesive capsulitis', which was defined as the patient having increased pain at night, but normal or slightly affected range of movement.

c Patients had adhesive capsulitis, which was defined as some reduction in pain but considerably reduced range of movement that can even affect activities of normal living.

Study: Fang 2006⁸²**Outcome: Adverse events**

Not reported

Study: Ma 2006⁸³**Outcome: Pain (pain at rest) measured using 0–10 numeric scale**

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	1.8	NR	
Acupuncture		30	2.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	2.6	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	0.9	NR	0.0448
Acupuncture		30	0.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	0.9	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	0.4	NR	0.0238
Acupuncture		30	0.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	0.7	NR	

Outcome: Pain (pain on activity) measured using 0–10 numeric scale

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	6.4	NR	
Acupuncture		30	7.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	7.4	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	5.4	NR	0.0398
Acupuncture		30	5.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	4.1	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	3.7	NR	0.0137
Acupuncture		30	4.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	3.3	NR	

NR, not reported; PT, physiotherapy.

^a *p*-value for between-group differences.

Study: Ma 2006⁹³**Outcome: Range of movement – active abduction (°)**

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	70.6	NR	
Acupuncture		30	88.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	79.5	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	84.9	NR	0.2645
Acupuncture		30	90.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	90.3	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	98.3	NR	0.1634
Acupuncture		30	115.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	110.1	NR	

Outcome: Range of movement – active external rotation (°)

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	15.9	NR	
Acupuncture		30	32.1	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	20.7	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	27.3	NR	0.5453
Acupuncture		30	42.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	30.1	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	28.3	NR	0.0367
Acupuncture		30	43.2	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	36.1	NR	

Outcome: Range of movement – active internal rotation (°)

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	30	NR	
Acupuncture		30	41.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	33.6	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	37.5	NR	0.0656
Acupuncture		30	48.5	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	47.6	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	43.9	NR	0.0656
Acupuncture		30	51.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		5	54.4	NR	

Outcome: Range of movement – passive abduction (°)

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	78	NR	
Acupuncture		30	94.9	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	84.8	NR	

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	91.8	NR	0.0735
Acupuncture		30	99.2	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	100.5	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	103.3	NR	0.0675
Acupuncture		30	120	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	110.7	NR	
Outcome: Range of movement – passive external rotation (°)					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	23.4	NR	
Acupuncture		30	43.2	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	29.6	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	33.9	NR	0.6952
Acupuncture		30	55.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	34.2	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	33.8	NR	0.8952
Acupuncture		30	52.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	38.5	NR	
Outcome: Range of movement – passive internal rotation (°)					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	37.6	NR	
Acupuncture		30	52.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	45.7	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	44.1	NR	0.7345
Acupuncture		30	59.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	50.1	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	51.3	NR	0.4345
Acupuncture		30	56.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	59.2	NR	

NR, not reported; PT, physiotherapy.

^a *p*-value for between-group differences.

Note: Other range of movements reported, which were not of relevance to this review and are therefore not presented in the data extraction tables, included active flexion and extension and passive flexion and extension.

Study: Ma 2006⁹³**Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 physical function**

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	74.8	NR	
Acupuncture		30	71.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	75.3	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	79	NR	0.3743
Acupuncture		30	78.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	86.9	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	86.1	NR	0.8746
Acupuncture		30	81.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	86.9	NR	

Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 role physical

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	20.2	NR	
Acupuncture		30	43.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	32.4	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	41.7	NR	0.7445
Acupuncture		30	56.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	45.7	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	49.4	NR	0.0745
Acupuncture		30	45	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	45.1	NR	

Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 bodily pain

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	46.3	NR	
Acupuncture		30	50.9	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	42.6	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	58.9	NR	0.4033
Acupuncture		30	54.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	50.4	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	58.7	NR	0.6783
Acupuncture		30	66.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	53.4	NR	

Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 general health

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	58.9	NR	
Acupuncture		30	50.5	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	54.3	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	63.3	NR	0.6004
Acupuncture		30	58.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	60.1	NR	

PT	4 weeks	30	73.3	NR	0.0604
Acupuncture		30	61.3	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	57.3	NR	
Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 vitality					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	58.1	NR	
Acupuncture		30	53.4	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	52.4	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	69.3	NR	0.7894
Acupuncture		30	62.5	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	65.3	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	73.3	NR	0.8894
Acupuncture		30	65	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	67.1	NR	
Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 social functioning					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	83.9	NR	
Acupuncture		30	60.2	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	77.3	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	93.3	NR	0.0567
Acupuncture		30	68.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	89.5	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	93.1	NR	0.0677
Acupuncture		30	75	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	83.5	NR	
Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 role emotional					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	57	NR	
Acupuncture		30	75	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	70.4	NR	
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	61.1	NR	0.3458
Acupuncture		30	77.8	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	75.8	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	66.3	NR	0.0578
Acupuncture		30	78.6	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	79.3	NR	
Outcome: Quality of life – SF-36 mental health					
<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. randomised</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	
PT	Baseline	30	62.6	NR	
Acupuncture		30	69	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	65	NR	

<i>Intervention</i>	<i>Time point</i>	<i>No. analysed</i>	<i>Final value mean</i>	<i>SD</i>	<i>p-value^a</i>
PT	2 weeks	30	65.9	NR	0.061
Acupuncture		30	72.7	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	68.6	NR	
PT	4 weeks	30	66.9	NR	0.091
Acupuncture		30	73	NR	
Acupuncture + PT		15	69.1	NR	

NR, not reported; PT, physiotherapy.

a *p*-value for between-group differences.

Study: Ma 2006⁸³

Outcome: Other

Not reported

Study: Ma 2006⁸³

Outcome: Adverse events

Not reported
